Finding Closure

Grieving practices after the WTC terrorist attacks

Victor Toom
Newcastle upon Tyne, 14 July 2016
ESRC seminar series on genetics, technology, security and justice'

- Presentation prepared for ESRC seminar at Northumbria University in Newcastle upon Tyne, 14-15 July 2016
- Research was funded by the Leverhulme Trust

Closure

- "Dr. John Rolland, a psychiatrist and co-director of the Center for Family Health at the University of Chicago, said, "Many families are waiting for some sign, like DNA analysis, that tells them, 'Yes, this is your family member,' to reach a stage of finality that a loss has occurred. [...] "There are differences in people's readiness to accept death," Dr. Rolland noted. "Not everyone in a family will come to closure at the same time. This is one of the things that tears families apart. One person may say, 'Get on with it, you know he's dead,' and another will say, 'You're a pessimist.' "
 - The New York Times, September 20, 2001

Closure in DVI practices

- "Families and communities, not knowing whether their members are alive or dead, are unable to obtain <u>closure</u> on the violent events that have disrupted their lives. Their anxiety remains with them for years after the fighting has subsided and peace returned. They are unable to <u>move on</u> to personal or community rehabilitation and reconciliation."
 - ICRC 2003: 9
- "The lack of identity of the dead also implies that family members cannot bury the body according to valued rituals, or to cry for their loss in order to move ahead with the closure that comes from honoring the corpse."
 - WHO 2004: 97
- "The reality is that in many cases the individuals have been killed, and only through identification of the remains can <u>closure</u> be made possible for the families/communities."
 - Tidball-Binz et al 2013: e212



The Missing:

Action to resolve the problem of people unaccounted for as a result armed conflict or internal violence and to assist their families.

ICRC REPORT: THE MISSING AND THEIR FAMILIE

International Conference of Governmental and Non-Government Experts (19-21 February 2003)

Moses statement

The same is to beginn invariances among operationers, the initiary international and control organization initiating the workstoner file of the same files of beautiful measures or and the personnal point initiating people consciouslished for an a result of amond conflict or internal ordinate and about the anguish of their far by overating and method, workfall to both for action and communication in order for more accountability on the part of the authorities responsible for residency like problems of mile.



6 ICRC/TheNissingR12003ENR0 (Original English

Management of Dead Bodies in Disaster Situations

isaster Manuals and Guidelines Series, N° 5



Thread profes deviational careers (agreement today of (201) (212)



A good practice guide for the use of topensic genetics applied to rights and international humanitarian law investigations M. Tidball-Brat. V. Prechagadeh C. Vallov, M. Salado Pietro J. L. Fodebride M. Tidball-Brat. V. Prechagadeh C. Vallov, M. Salado Pietro J. L. Toleral W. Con-

M. Tidbull-Bise*, V. Prochaszadeh*, C. Vullo*, M. Salado Paerto*, L. Fondebride L. Carfotto*, A. Gersharsk*, F. Villegas Belodas*, S. Albertelli*, L. Tolar*, W. Goo "International of the drive, international control of the Control of the Control of the Control of International Control of Contr

"Repetitive Patricts', Institutings' From, Wyshelled
"Disselved His of the Patrick Education," Agentitive
"Research Research System Counting & Agentium
"Research Research Systems, Minerally & American State Intelligence (Mineral Research Systems) of Research Research Systems for State Intelligence Systems for State Intelligence Systems (Mineral Research Systems) (Minera

A BY 12's B 1961'S PRODUCT STATES Bright A Brighter 1981 6'special Commercial STA 8'special Commercial STA 8'special Commercial STA 8'special Commercial STA A DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY

termination and incommittation on November per invest from a light of the sign Montan (figure on November per invest and reministration (November per investigation) of the sign Montan (Montan on November per investigation) of the sign Montan of the sign Montan (Montan on November per investigation) of the sign and si

interduction. The supply of the mining (the issue this supported individually, both fined and after whose far-index is understand, some is understood for fundamentations, our a sensitive to the fundamentation of the support of the fundamental to the fundamental to the fundamental to the fundamental to the fundamental fundamental to the fundamental fundamental to the fundamental fundamental fundamental to the fundamental fu

professors and he found when a transfers programs. These professors is more on informamonies on informamonies of semalais, established at temples, the new days of an ISSQ of uncomment. The information of an international programs and offers the enabled and completes.

* | Independing author, felt, rede 1722 (Febber, 1-866-887)); virginion solicitation, in [16] (Gebern);

Closure

• But families tell me that there's no such thing as closure or getting back to normal

But what is closure?

- Moving on through various 'stages' of grief: denial, anger, bargaining, depression, acceptance (this seems to suggest that grief needs to be finished—closed off)
 - Kubler-Ross 1669
- "Bereavement: Intense yearning or longing for the deceased, intense sorrow and emotional pain, and preoccupation with the deceased or the circumstances of the death are expected responses occurring in bereavement, whereas fear of separation from other attachment figures is central in separation anxiety disorder."
 - DSM V 2013: 194
- Closure: "the ability to put trauma behind you and reach an even keel."
 - Berns 2011: 8

But what is closure?

- Berns (2011: x) aims to "shed light at on how closure has become a new emotion that people are seeking even when it is not at all clear what closure means or even if it exists. Closure has emerged as a new way of talking about grief and loss, which has led to new expectations for those who are grieving."
- Closure is a made-up concept "to explain how we should respond to loss" (p. 4).



Closure

The Rush to End Grief and What It Costs Us

Nancy Berns

From closure to finding closure

- How do WTC victims' families invent rituals in the wake of 9/11?
- Research in New York City on the WTC tragedy
- 2,750 victims
 - ~22,000 human remains; 60 % identified, 40 % unidentified
 - Identification took in most instances longer than a year and still continues with a last identification made last year (2015)
- Interviews with ~50 interlocutors involved in 9/11's forensic, emotional, legal, bureaucratic and politicized aftermath
 - How did family members of WTC victims grief when it took so long until someone was identified?
 - What changed when someone's body was identified and repatriated?
 - How to mourn in the absence of a body to grief over?

 Slides are deleted as sharing slides/quotes is not in accordance with informed consent procedures

Grieving practices

Identified

- Peaceful, calming, divine intervention
- Able to bury someone, a place to go to, journey in healing, proof
- Identification sometimes comes with information about recovery location, allows kin to construct a story about a loved one's death and hence adds to personhood

Remaining at large

- No certainty, no ceremony with a body to pay respect and say goodbye to
- No burial of a body renders problematic resurrection in religious doctrines
- Incoherent narratives, denial and hope (your mind plays tricks on you)
- Empty grave burials, objects or ashes buried that represent a missing person

Final remarks

- Identification comes with various 'goods'; remaining at large becomes associated with 'bads'
- In the absence of bodies to bury, families often copy 'normal' funeral and burial practices
 - Empty grave burials, objects/ashes representing a missing person, memorials
 - Ash, dirt, ground, soil
- Finding closure becomes articulated through the practices where victims are not identified:
 - Uncertainty, no narrative about someone's final moments
 - No place to go to

Final remark

- Referring to "closure" and "moving on" normatively underscores normal grief trajectories
- Achieving closure as a societal rule of how to behave, act, feel, communicate etc.
- DVI practices should hence not aimed at achieving closure, but at facilitating the tasks and its practices of grieving

toomvictor@gmail.com

The Leverhulme Trust